#### Center for Advanced Non-Ferrous Structural Alloys

An Industry/University Cooperative Research Center

#### Project 19: Mechanism of Dwell Fatigue Crack Initiation in Ti-7AI Under Biaxial Tension-Tension Loads

Thrust Area 2: High Performance Non-Ferrous Alloys

Spring 2018 Semi-Annual Meeting Colorado School of Mines, Golden, CO April 11-12, 2018

Student: Garrison Hommer (CSM)

Faculty: Dr. Aaron Stebner (CSM) & Dr. Peter Collins (ISU) Industrial Mentor(s): Dr. Adam Pilchak (AFRL)





#### **Project 19: Mechanism of Dwell Fatigue Crack Initiation in Ti-7Al Under Biaxial Tension-Tension Loads Dashboard**

<ul> <li>Student: Garrison Homer (Mines)</li> <li>Advisor(s): Aaron Stebner (Mines), Adam Pilchak (AFRL)</li> </ul>	Project Duration PhD: September 2015 to March 2018									
<ul> <li><u>Problem:</u> Stress dwell periods are detrimental to fatigue life of Ti alloys. Biaxial tension-tension failure is not predicted from uniaxial data.</li> <li><u>Objective:</u> Under biaxial tension-tension loads, determine microstructural mechanisms of dwell fatigue and define hard and soft grain orientations.</li> <li><u>Benefit:</u> Improved life management for biaxially loaded locations.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li><u>Recent Progress</u></li> <li>Cyclic evolutions of stress m</li> <li>Interdependencies of stress and loading ratios (i.e., 1:4 a)</li> <li>Effects of grain neighborhoo individual grains</li> <li>Successfully defended and s</li> </ul>	netrics metrics, orientations, and 1:1 X:Y stress) od characteristics on submitted PhD thesis								
Metrics										
Description	% Complete	Status								
1. Planar biaxial specimen design	100%	•								
2. Literature review	100%	•								
3. Macroscopic characterization of tension-tension mechanical resp	100%	•								
4. Microstructural mechanisms of dwell fatigue under biaxial tension	100%	•								
5. Provide microstructural data for instantiation of crystal plasticity s	100%	•								

5. Provide microstructural data for instantiation of crystal plasticity simulations of 11 dwell fatigue





#### Major components of this project

- Design of experimental platform
  - Planar biaxial platform for nondestructive 3D grain scale studies via high energy diffraction microscopy (HEDM)

 Application of experimental platform
 Dwell fatigue in alpha titanium subjected to multiaxial loads





#### Major components of this project

- > Design of experimental platform
  - Planar biaxial platform for nondestructive 3D grain scale studies via high energy diffraction microscopy (HEDM)

 Application of experimental platform
 Dwell fatigue in alpha titanium subjected to multiaxial loads



#### In situ HEDM planar biaxial experiment

- Specimen geometry •
- Planar biaxial load frame

- Synchrotron X-ray diffraction •
- Data collection & analysis technique



Video courtesy of Harshad Paranjape





## Multiscale In situ HEDM data capabilities



## Multiscale In situ HEDM data capabilities



#### Major components of this project

- Design of experimental platform
  - Planar biaxial platform for nondestructive 3D grain scale studies via high energy diffraction microscopy (HEDM)
- Application of experimental platform
   Dwell fatigue in alpha titanium subjected to multiaxial loads





#### **Biaxial Dwell fatigue in Ti-7AI outline**

- What is dwell fatigue, why does it affect Ti alloys, and why is this work relevant?
- Material and experimental methods
- Normalized resolved shear stress pole figures (nRSS PFs)
- Plasticity metrics: stress coaxiality angle (SCA) and Mises stress

ADVANCED NONFERROUS STRUCTURAL ALLOY

- Mechanics of cyclic evolutions
- Mechanics of load shedding
- Grain neighborhood effects





### **Biaxial Dwell fatigue in Ti-7AI outline**

- What is dwell fatigue, why does it affect Ti alloys, and why is this work relevant?
- Material and experimental methods
- Normalized resolved shear stress pole figures (nRSS PFs)
- Plasticity metrics: stress coaxiality angle (SCA) and Mises stress
- Mechanics of cyclic evolutions
- Mechanics of load shedding
- Grain neighborhood effects







# Cold dwell fatigue reduces lifetime in Ti alloys

Reduction in fatigue life resulting from stress dwell periods

>  $\sigma_{max}/\sigma_{0.2}$  = 0.92, 1, 1.05 (80 s) life reduction = 2, 5, 30

➢ Occurs at temperatures ≤ ~200 °C

11

Thermal activation eliminates dwell effect at T > ~200 °C



## Origin of dwell fatigue in Ti alloys

- $\geq \alpha$ -phase in Ti alloys has HCP crystal structure
- Limited deformation mechanisms at low temperature
  - Twinning suppressed in dwell sensitive alloys by aluminum content ( > 5 wt. % )
  - Strong slip system anisotropy (prism:basal:pyramidal II, 0.9 : 1.0 : 3.0)
  - Less hardening, room temperature creep in soft grains (rate dependence) A Luque et al., Modelling and



## Origin of dwell fatigue in Ti alloys

#### $\geq \alpha$ -phase in Ti alloys has HCP crystal structure

#### Limited deformation mechanisms at low temperature

- Twinning suppressed in dwell sensitive alloys by aluminum content ( > 5 wt. % )
- Strong slip system anisotropy (prism:basal:pyramidal II, 0.9 : 1.0 : 3.0)
- Less hardening, room temperature creep in soft grains (rate dependence) A Luque et al., Modelling and



## <sup>14</sup> Ti alloy compressor discs experience biaxial dwell fatigue

- > Titanium alloy jet engine turbine compressor discs
- Enhance life prediction
  - Biaxial loading effect on fatigue life not well characterized

RootWeb1:4 X:Y stress biaxial tension1:1 X:Y stress biaxial tension



http://www.daviddarling.info/images/Concorde\_Olympus\_engine.jpg



http://www.ashbyinteriors.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2014/09/DSC\_0707-p.jpg





## Ti alloy biaxial dwell fatigue goals:

- Define multiaxial hard and soft grain orientations
- Determine microstructural mechanisms
- Investigate grain behaviors as functions of:
  - ➢ Cycles
  - ➢ Orientation
  - Neighborhood characteristics
- Qualitative life assessment relative to uniaxial dwell fatigue
- Provide insight into observed failure orientations





#### **Biaxial Dwell fatigue in Ti-7AI outline**

- What is dwell fatigue, why does it affect Ti alloys, and why is this work relevant?
- Material and experimental methods
- Normalized resolved shear stress pole figures (nRSS PFs)
- Plasticity metrics: stress coaxiality angle (SCA) and Mises stress
- Mechanics of cyclic evolutions
- Mechanics of load shedding
- Grain neighborhood effects







#### **Material microstructure**



### Methods for in situ dwell fatigue at APS

- Tension-tension 1:1 and 1:4 X:Y stress ratio dwell fatigue
  - Used specimens from previous experiments (100 and 310 cycles at ~80 % yield stress)
- 120 second holds in force control
- 1 second load and unload
- ~100 % yield stress
- HEDM data points at load and unload
  - ➢ Reference & cycles 1 − 5, 50
  - > 1 x 0.8 mm<sup>2</sup> total beam size
    - ~1.2 x 0.8 x 0.5 mm<sup>3</sup> illuminated volume







#### **Biaxial Dwell fatigue in Ti-7AI outline**

- What is dwell fatigue, why does it affect Ti alloys, and why is this work relevant?
- Material and experimental methods
- Normalized resolved shear stress pole figures (nRSS PFs)
- Plasticity metrics: stress coaxiality angle (SCA) and Mises stress

ADVANCED NONFERROUS STRUCTURAL ALLOYS

- Mechanics of cyclic evolutions
- Mechanics of load shedding
- Grain neighborhood effects





#### **Composites of Basal-Prismatic** *normalized* resolved shear stress on (0001) pole figures (IPFs)



#### <sup>21</sup> Composites of Basal-Prismatic *normalized* resolved shear stress on (0001) pole figures (IPFs)



# <sup>22</sup> Average nRSS in 1:4 and 1:1 X:Y stress ratio specimens



#### **Biaxial Dwell fatigue in Ti-7AI outline**

- What is dwell fatigue, why does it affect Ti alloys, and why is this work relevant?
- Material and experimental methods
- Normalized resolved shear stress pole figures (nRSS PFs)
- Plasticity metrics: stress coaxiality angle (SCA) and Mises stress
- Mechanics of cyclic evolutions
- Mechanics of load shedding
- Grain neighborhood effects







#### <sup>24</sup> Stress coaxiality angle (SCA) and Mises stress as metrics for plastic deformation

Plastic deformation leads to increase in SCA and decrease in Mises stress

Stress Coaxiality Angle: $\theta =$ scalar measure of alignment betweenapplied stress tensor and grain stress tensor

$$\theta = \cos^{-1} \left( \frac{\sigma_{applied} : \sigma_{grain}}{|\sigma_{applied}| |\sigma_{grain}|} \right)$$



#### **Biaxial Dwell fatigue in Ti-7AI outline**

- What is dwell fatigue, why does it affect Ti alloys, and why is this work relevant?
- Material and experimental methods
- Normalized resolved shear stress pole figures (nRSS PFs)
- Plasticity metrics: stress coaxiality angle (SCA) and Mises stress
- Mechanics of cyclic evolutions
- Mechanics of load shedding
- Grain neighborhood effects







## Empirical cumulative distribution functions (ECDFs) highlight cyclic SCA differences in 4:4 & 1:4 stress ratios

- 1:4 higher median SCA
   (20.4°) indicates more plastic
   deformation than 4:4 (12.4°)
- 1:4 low SCA tail indicates fewer hard behaving grains than 4:4
- ➢ 4:4 cyclic shift indicates more cyclic plasticity than 1:4
  - Less plastic shakedown in 1:1, 150 cycles vs. 360
  - Basal slip dominance causes less hardening



Center Proprietary – Terms of CANFSA Membership Agreement Apply



26

#### Mises stress ECDFs highlight greater soft-hard grain disparity in 4:4 stress ratio

#### 4:4 ratio has wider distribution

27

- Larger disparity between soft and hard grains
- 4:4 ratio cyclic behavior indicative of load shedding
  - Upper tail of 4:4 ratio shifts to higher stress
  - Lower half of 4:4 ratio shifts to lower stress





#### Ti<sub>3</sub>Al precipitates (coherent)

- Initial strengthening followed by glide plane softening & highly planar slip after shearing
- Observed in monotonic loading



Pagan et al., Acta. Mat., 2017





#### Ti<sub>3</sub>Al precipitates (coherent)

- Initial strengthening followed by glide plane softening & highly planar slip after shearing
- Observed in monotonic loading

Shift in basal ECDF at high RSS indicates cyclic basal softening





#### Ti<sub>3</sub>Al precipitates (coherent)

- Initial strengthening followed by glide plane softening & highly planar slip after shearing
- Observed in monotonic loading



Pagan et al., Acta. Mat., 2017



- 4:4 basal CRSS > 1:4 basal CRSS
- 4:4 softening > 1:4 softening
  - ➤ 150 vs. 360 cycles
  - Less plastic shakedown in 4:4

Less hardening in 4:4



Cycle 101: more Ti<sub>3</sub>Al shearing
 Cycle 150: more planar slip



**Membership Agreement Apply** 

#### **Biaxial Dwell fatigue in Ti-7AI outline**

- What is dwell fatigue, why does it affect Ti alloys, and why is this work relevant?
- Material and experimental methods
- Normalized resolved shear stress pole figures (nRSS PFs)
- Plasticity metrics: stress coaxiality angle (SCA) and Mises stress
- Mechanics of cyclic evolutions
- Mechanics of load shedding
- Grain neighborhood effects





#### SCA decreases with increasing Mises stress except at highest stresses

Stronger 1:1 basal nRSS dependence due to texture

33

- 1:1 has distinctly hard grains
- Highest Mises stress grains show SCA increase





## Hydrostatic stress does not trend with SCA, Mises stress, or orientation

34

 $\blacktriangleright$  Hydrostatic stress:  $\sigma_{\rm H} = (\sigma_{11} + \sigma_{22} + \sigma_{33}) / 3$ 



# SCA exhibits strong trends with stress triaxiality and orientation

Basal nRSS

0.5

0.4

0.3

0.2

0.1

1000 1200

800

Stress triaxiality =  $\sigma_{\rm H} / \sigma_{\rm VM}$ 

35

- Stress triaxiality at minimum S plane stress elastic calculation ratio
  - Higher indicates load shedding
  - Lower indicates load receiving





Coaxiality Angle (°)

30

20

10

0

200

400

600

#### <sup>36</sup> Out of plane stress trends strongly with stress triaxiality

X and Y stresses are directly affected by load shedding and receiving



### <sup>37</sup> Out of plane stress trends strongly with stress triaxiality

- X and Y stresses are directly affected by load shedding and receiving
- Basal nRSS Z stress is driven by X and Y stresses 2.5 2 0.41.5 0.3 1:1 0.2 Mechanism of crack initiation on soft 0.1 0.5 (near) basal planes due to load shedding: -500 0 500 Z Stress (MPa) Basal nRSS > Planar dislocation pileup: microvoids 2 0.5High stress triaxiality 0.4 1.5 0.3 Decohesion of (near) basal planes 1:4 0.2 0.5 0.1 -400-200200 400 0





# Out of plane stress trends strongly with stress triaxiality

- X and Y stresses are directly affected by load shedding and receiving
- Z stress is driven by X and Y stresses
- Mechanism of crack propagation on hard (near) basal planes due to load shedding:
- Initiation in soft neighbor
   Additional load shedding
   Removal of Z (Poisson) direction constraint





38



#### **Biaxial Dwell fatigue in Ti-7AI outline**

- What is dwell fatigue, why does it affect Ti alloys, and why is this work relevant?
- Material and experimental methods
- Normalized resolved shear stress pole figures (nRSS PFs)
- Plasticity metrics: stress coaxiality angle (SCA) and Mises stress
- Mechanics of cyclic evolutions
- Mechanics of load shedding
- Grain neighborhood effects





#### <sup>40</sup> Neighborhood dependencies of 1:1 soft grains with minimum Mises stress

(0001)

- Selected grains with lowest Mises stress
  - Indicates unconstrained plastic deformation
  - Soft grains in soft neighborhoods
- SCA:
  - Decreases with increasing neighborhood Mises stress
  - Increases with increasing basal nRSS (outliers)
  - Increases with increasing prismatic nRSS
  - Dual slip family activation results in higher SCA than single



#### Summary

- New experimental platform enables nondestructive multiaxial 3D micromechanical studies
  - Custom planar biaxial load frame & specimen geometry
  - Advanced materials (anisotropy, asymmetry, path dependence)
- > Dwell fatigue in Ti-7Al under biaxial tension-tension loads
  - HCP (α) phase is source of dwell fatigue: limited and anisotropic slip systems
  - Improve life management of jet engine turbine compressor discs
  - Defined soft and hard grain orientations (nRSS PFs)
  - Qualitative assessment of lifetime differences between uniaxial and biaxial loading
  - Observed cyclic basal slip system softening
  - Observed mechanics of dwell fatigue (load shedding, stress tensor evolution, grain neighborhood effects)
  - Provided new insight into mechanisms of crack initiation and propagation
  - Hard neighborhoods reduce SCA and increase Mises stress in soft grains (constraint)







- Ti-7Al mechanics publications
- Fractography and microstructural characterization
- Redo experiments with equal cycles between 1:1 and 1:4 stress ratios
- > Redo experiments under strain control
- Dwell fatigue lifetime tests
- Design to promote multiaxial stress states in dwell sensitive components
- Incorporate basal softening into models





			2017	,						2018				
Name	Begin date	End date	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	l Feb	l Mar	Apr	May
<ul> <li>Planar Biaxial Specimen Design</li> </ul>	6/1/15	11/18/16					9/30/17							
<ul> <li>FEA optimization</li> </ul>	6/1/15	8/13/15												
<ul> <li>Experimental validation</li> </ul>	8/13/15	11/18/16												
<ul> <li>Literature Review</li> </ul>	9/1/15	5/10/18												-
<ul> <li>General dwell fatigue</li> </ul>	9/1/15	10/1/15												
<ul> <li>Dwell fatigue mechanisms</li> </ul>	9/1/15	10/30/15												
<ul> <li>Areas for further study</li> </ul>	10/1/15	5/10/18												
<ul> <li>In Situ Mechanical Testing</li> </ul>	12/15/15	8/15/17	•		_									
<ul> <li>Experimental setup</li> </ul>	12/15/15	2/19/16												
<ul> <li>Equibiaxial tension-tension loading</li> </ul>	2/10/16	8/15/17												
<ul> <li>Non-equibiaxial tension-tension loading</li> </ul>	8/10/16	8/15/17												
<ul> <li>Equibiaxial dwell fatigue</li> </ul>	1/2/17	8/15/17												
<ul> <li>Non-equibiaxial dwell fatigue</li> </ul>	1/2/17	8/15/17												
<ul> <li>Dwell fatigue crystal plasticity instantiation</li> </ul>	5/16/17	11/15/17												
<ul> <li>Data Analysis</li> </ul>	1/1/16	5/10/18												_
<ul> <li>Bulk trends</li> </ul>	1/1/16	5/10/18												
<ul> <li>Grain neighborhood effects</li> </ul>	6/1/17	5/10/18												

Today





#### Acknowledgements

- Advisors and committee
  - Aaron Stebner, Adam Pilchak, Branden Kappes, John Berger, Peter Collins, Michael Kaufman
- Fellow research group members
  - Ashley Bucsek, Harshad Paranjape, Jinesh Dahal, Zach Brunson, Nathan Johnson, Bryan Marsh, Luis Ham Villa, Andrew Peterson
- Argonne National Lab Advanced Photon Source (APS) 1-ID Beam Line
  - Jonathan Almer, Peter Kenesei, Ali Mashayekhi, Jun-Sang Park
- MTS Systems Corporation
  - Steve Lemmer, Justin Vignes

#### Funding

 $\geq$ 

MTS

ADVANCED NONFERROUS STRUCTURAL ALLOYS

- Air Force Research Laboratory (AFRL)
- Center of Advanced Non-Ferrous Structural Alloys (CANFSA)
- National Science Foundation Civil, Mechanical and Manufacturing Innovation (NSF-CMMI) Award # 1454668







## **Thank You**

Garrison Hommer Colorado School of Mines ghommer@mines.edu (715) 456 5754

# References, Acknowledgements, and Contact

[1] Véronique Doquet, Vincent De Greef, Dwell-fatigue of a titanium alloy at room temperature under uniaxial or biaxial tension (2011)

[2] Zhen Zhang, M.A. Cuddihy, F.P.E. Dunne, On rate-dependent polycrystal deformation: the temperature sensitivity of cold dwell fatigue (2015)

[3] J.C. Williams, R.G. Baggerly, N.E. Paton, Deformation Behavior of HCP Ti-Al Alloy Single Crystals (2002)

[4]V. Doquet and V. De Greef, "Dwell-fatigue of a titanium alloy at room temperature under uniaxial or biaxial tension," Int. J. Fatigue, vol. 38, pp. 118–129, May 2012.

[5] Bernier, J. V., N. R. Barton, U. Lienert, and M. P. Miller. (2011). J of Strain Analysis for Engg Design

[6] Sharma, Hemant, Richard M. Huizenga, Aleksei Bytchkov, Jilt Sietsma, and S. Erik Offerman. (2012). Acta Mat



45

- > CANFSA
- NSF-CMMI Award # 1454668
  - Experiment and specimen design
- > AFRL
  - Material studies
- Advanced Photon Source (APS) 1-ID Beam Line
  - > In situ experiments

Garrison Hommer Colorado School of Mines ghommer@mines.edu (715) 456 5754





## Penar biaxial loading using

## cruciform geometry

#### Logical extension of uniaxial tension/compression



#### Custom planar biaxial load frame attributes

- Diffraction
  - Compact (~ 3 x 3 x 0.5 ft, ~500 lbs)
  - > Transportable
  - Sample center deviation < 5 μm at maximum load (25 kN per axis)
  - 320° rotation without beam obstruction (260° data with 15° diffraction cone
  - Beam Alignment
- Mechanical
  - 4 Independent hydraulic actuators
  - All ratios of tension/compression
  - 4 alignment fixtures
  - Aligned for < 30 με (0.003 %) bending under load







### <sup>48</sup> Specimen geometry: tension, compression and diffraction capable





### **Experimental setup at the Advanced Photon Source, 1-ID-E beamline**



### <sup>50</sup> Specimen geometry: variable maximum gage stress



#### Planar biaxial can elucidate anisotropy and

#### asymmetry of complete yield locus





#### Microstructural effects on diffraction patterns.

Diffracted beam from individual polycrystal grains produces spot pattern on area detector





#### **Bimodal grain size distribution**

#### *Powder* = *small grains*









Spots = large grains Center Proprietary – Terms of CANFSA Membership Agreement Apply

#### **Ti-7Al diffraction rings: high plastic**

#### Highly smeared spots





#### Membership Agreement Apply

#### **Ti-7Al diffraction rings: low plastic**

➢ Distinct spots
 ➢ "large" grains (~100 µm)
 ➢ No smearing
 ➢ No plastic deformation





#### Membership Agreement Apply

#### Beam, specimen and grain



MINES

#### Far-field vs. near-field HEDM

- Far-field: grain strain and orientation
- Near-field: grain morphology



## Model shows soft grain strain

- > Z. Zheng et al., International Journal of Plasticity (2016)
- Soft grains show residual compressive stresses
- > Hard grains show residual tensile stresses





#### Origins of anisotropy and asymmetry

- Texture
- Grain shape
- Low symmetry crystal lattices
- Several deformation mechanisms
  - Slip, twinning, phase transformation
  - Asymmetry and anisotropy
  - Path dependence

IOWA STATE

Mg and Ti alloys: hexagonal close packed (HCP)

а

С

at/~hadlev/ss1/problems/kittel1\_3/hcp.gi

NiTi alloys: some with monoclinic phase



**prietary – Terms of CANFSA** 

ership Agreement Apply

http://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/ commons/thumb/6/67/Monoclinic\_cell .svg/438px-Monoclinic\_cell.svg.png

# HEDM constraints, requirements and limitations

- Load frame
  - Rotation/translation stage weight limit: 600 lbs.
  - Maximize angular range of 2D data sets: 360°
  - Align specimen center with rotation axis
    - Maintain same grains in beam
    - Maintain sample-to-detector distance
- Specimen
  - Maximum penetration depth: 2 4 mm
  - No diffracted beam interference
- Material
  - Minimum grain size: ~25 μm
  - Maximum grains in beam: 1000's
  - Grain size uniformity
  - Not heavily deformed











# <sup>63</sup> Specimen geometry: diffraction capabilities

- $\succ$  Measurable diffraction angle (2 $\theta$ ) function of
  - ➢ Beam width (w)
  - Material penetration capability (t)



## Experimental setup at the

Hydraulic lines







#### <sup>65</sup> Neighborhood dependencies of hard orientations with minimum SCA

- Selected grains with low basal nRSS and SCA
   Low SCA indicates not receiving load
   Hard grains in hard neighborhoods
- 1:1 Mises stress increases with increasing neighborhood
- 1:4 trend weak, no distinctly hard grains



#### <sup>66</sup> Neighborhood dependencies of hard grains with maximum Mises stress

- Selected grains with highest Mises stress
   Indicates receiving load
  - Hard grains in soft neighborhoods
- 1:1 Mises stress decreases with increasing neighborhood
   Softer neighborhoods shed more load



Probe atomic scale with particle beam



#### Load frame finraction fapabilities

- 322° total rotation without load frame interference with incident beam
- Minimum 15° diffraction cone for 3D reconstruction techniques
  - 50 70 keV X-ray source
- 262° of sample rotation

IOWA STATE 2

